

Cultural Properties Review Committee Minutes
Minutes: June 7, 2019
Bataan Building Old Senate Chambers, Santa Fe, NM

The meeting of the State of New Mexico Cultural Properties Review Committee was called to order by Interim Chairman Reginald Richey at approximately 1:00 p.m. on the above-cited date, in the Bataan Memorial Building Old Senate Chambers, Santa Fe, New Mexico.

Interim Chair Richey characterized the CPRC as a statutory body charged with identifying and advising on the protection of the State's cultural properties. CPRC meetings are run by parliamentary procedure. He asked that all attendees follow those rules, sign in, and turn cell phones off.

A quorum was established with the following members.

Members Present:

Reginald Richey, Chair (Interim)
Douglas Boggess
Christopher Purvis
Matthew Bandy
Ronald Toya, Secretary
Delilah Tenorio (Legal Counsel)

Members Absent:

State Personnel Present:

Jeff Pappas, SHPO
Michelle Ensey
Andrew Zink
Steven Moffson
Harvey Kaplan
Gretchen Brock
Annette Apodaca – Note taker [*Sign-in Sheet on file at HPD*]

PROCEEDINGS:

Approval of Agenda

Interim Chair, Reginald Richey called for approval of the agenda.

- Member Toya approved the minutes as submitted.
- Member Boggess seconded, and the motion passed unanimously

Approval of the minutes – June 7th, 2019

- Member Dr. Bandy moved to approve the minutes as submitted.
- Member Boggess seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

Chairman's Report

Interim Chair, Reginald Richey stated his report was going to be oral. Since the last meeting Reginald Richey signed the tax credit and permit letters.

- Member Toya moved to approve the Chairman's report.
- Member Dr. Bandy seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

State Historic Preservation Officer's Report: (oral)

Dr. Jeff Pappas, NMSHPO

Dr. Jeff Pappas began his report by congratulating and introducing the incoming State Historian, Robert Martinez.

He then thanked everyone for a successful Historic Preservation Awards Ceremony. All members of the board were invited to suggest any thoughts and ideas for any changes to the event for next year. Dr. Pappas recognized the staff once again for efforts and early preparation for the event, beginning in mid- to late January. Special thanks to Deputy Director Michelle Ensey, Lynette Pollari, Steven Moffson, and Annette Apodaca for coordinating and organizing this year's event.

Dr. Pappas also gave a big thanks to the Sharon Callahan for all her work with the NM Historic Preservation Alliance. She has been working on different digital platforms, websites and has approximately 7 years of long term strategic plans for promoting events.

NMCRIS UPGRADES:

The NMCRIS upgrade 80 page planning document is complete and the RFP for the new system build out is almost complete.

The NMAC Built Environment Workshop will be held on June 8 2019 at UNM Laurel Wallace set the agenda and HPD will be presenting on their HBI forms.

Dr. Pappas thanked the committee, Michelle Ensey, Steven Moffson, Steve Townsend and Scott Geister for helping streamline the forms

HPD-ALLIANCE INTERNSHIP:

Gulia has returned this summer to intern with the NM Historic Preservation Alliance. She has been interning with HPD for a number of years and has expressed interest in archeological research and studies.

HPD ANNOUNCEMENTS:

This year the Archeology Fair will be held in Portales at Black Water Draw. The plan is to take the ARCH Fair all over the state.

Dr. Pappas announced that he has sent recommendations for 3 new CPRC board members to the Cabinet Secretaries Office for consideration.

SITE PROPOSALS

State Register of Cultural Properties and National Register of Historic Places

The Henge (Chaves County)

The Henge is significant at the local level under National Register Criterion C in the area of art because The Henge, completed in October 1963, is an excellent example of large-scale modern abstract sculpture in New Mexico in the decades after the Second World War. Sculptor Herbert Goldman employed modern materials, mostly steel and concrete, to create megaliths, lintels, and cantilevered forms to evoke English Neolithic imagery. The large, stone-like forms finished with rough concrete and emerging from the earth were unlike any previous artwork in New Mexico. The Henge was built when few other commissions existed for large-scale, secular, abstract sculpture in the state. The Henge is also significance because the creative process shared between Donald B. Anderson and Goldman inspired Anderson to establish the Roswell Artists-in-Residence Program in 1967.

- Member Dr. Bandy moved to approve the nomination for listing in the State Register and forward the nomination to the Keeper of the National Register.
- Member Purvis seconded, and the motion was passed unanimously.
- Committee members discussed the motion with member Richey speaking in favor of. Board voted to approval motion with all members in 4 in favor, none opposed. Mr. Richey abstained from voting.

REPLACEMENT MARKERS/REVISED TEXT

Fort Sumner Cemetery/William “Billy the Kid” Bonney Grave (De Baca County)

SIDE 1

This cemetery is purported to be the military cemetery for Fort Sumner. Fort Sumner was deactivated by the US Army in 1869. A year later the post buildings were sold to Lucien B. Maxwell, one of the largest landowners in New Mexico. Maxwell moved to the area from Colfax County and rebuilt the former officers’ quarters into a 20-room Spanish Colonial-style house. Maxwell died in 1875 and is buried in the cemetery.

SIDE 2

William “Billy the Kid” Bonney Grave

1859-1881

Henry McCarty is better known by his alias, William “Billy the Kid” Bonney. His family moved to the New Mexico territory in 1873. Bonney was charged with numerous thefts and involved in nine murders during his brief life. At age 19, he was sentenced to death for the murder of Sheriff William Brady. On April 21, 1881, Bonney escaped from the Lincoln County jail, killing two deputies. He fled to Fort Sumner, the home of many of his friends. Bonney was shot and killed by Sheriff Pat Garrett in Peter Maxwell’s house on July 14, 1881. His grave in the Fort Sumner Cemetery was originally marked by a wooden cross.

- Member Boggess moved to table the motion until the new State Historian, Robert Martinez could review the language for approval of the replacement marker.
- Member Purvis seconded, and the motion was passed unanimously.

Española Valley (Rio Arriba County)

SIDE 1

Española Valley lies between the Jemez Mountains to the west and the Sangre de Cristo Mountains to the east. The Rio Grande bisects the valley, creating fertile agricultural lands for dry-land farming. Tewa-speaking Ancestral Pueblos arrived in the valley c.1200 and built cliff dwellings, pueblos, and irrigation systems. Their distinctive pottery and weaving traditions continue today.

SIDE 2

Gaspar Castaño de Sosa and 170 Spanish settlers led an unauthorized expedition to the valley in 1590-1591. Spanish settlers returned in 1598 led by Don Juan de Oñate and established a settlement near the present-day Pueblo of Ohkay Owinge. In the 1880s the valley's population increased with the extension of the Denver and Rio Grande Western Railroad (the Chili Line) along the Rio Grande. The valley has continuously reflected its Pueblo and Spanish heritage.

- Member Boggess moved to table the motion until the new State Historian, Robert Martinez could review the language for approval of the replacement marker.
- Member Purvis seconded, and the motion was passed unanimously.

Pilar (Taos County)

SIDE 1

In 1795, 25 families were granted land along the Rio Grande at Pilar then known as Cieneguilla. The Battle of Cieneguilla was fought nearby in March 1854, wherein a camp of Utes and Jicarilla Apaches inflicted heavy losses on two companies of US Army dragoons. The dragoons lost over a third of their forces and nearly all of their supplies. Their commanding officer was later brought to trial for allegedly instigating the conflict.

SIDE 2

Flechas Rayada, the leader of the Jicarilla camp, extended a peace offer a week after the battle and was refused. The battle perpetuated a campaign against Jicarilla Apache that resulted in their relocation to a reservation near Farmington, NM. Writing of the nomadic Jicarilla, New Mexico's Acting Governor declared that, "the best interests of the Territory ... demand their extinction or their resettlement in pueblos."

- Member Boggess move to table the motion until the new State Historian, Robert Martinez could review the language for approval of the replacement marker.
- Member Toya seconded, and the motion was passed unanimously.

Tomas "Black Jack" Ketchum (Union and Colfax Counties)

SIDE 1

In 1795, 25 families were granted land along the Rio Grande at Pilar then known as Cieneguilla. The Battle of Cieneguilla was fought nearby in March 1854, wherein a camp of Utes and Jicarilla Apaches inflicted heavy losses on two companies of US Army dragoons. The dragoons lost over a third of their forces and nearly all of their supplies. Their commanding officer was later brought to trial for allegedly instigating the conflict.

SIDE 2

Flechas Rayada, the leader of the Jicarilla camp, extended a peace offer a week after the battle and was refused. The battle perpetuated a campaign against Jicarilla Apache that resulted in their relocation to a reservation near Farmington, NM. Writing of the nomadic Jicarilla, New Mexico's Acting Governor declared that, "the best interests of the Territory ... demand their extinction or their resettlement in pueblos."

- Member Dr. Bandy moved to table the motion until the new State Historian, Robert Martinez could review the language for approval of the replacement marker.
- Member Boggess seconded, and the motion was passed unanimously.

US Rio Puerco Bridge (Socorro County)

(Same text both sides)

This historic bridge was built in 1930 and features two, steel Parker through-trusses that traverse the Rio Puerco, each with 141-foot spans. Steel-truss bridges were constructed in flood-prone areas and reflect the shift to standardized bridge design in New Mexico during the 1920s. This structure is one of about a half dozen Parker through-truss bridges remaining in the state. It has been preserved by the New Mexico Department of Transportation.

- Member moved to table the motion until the new State Historian, Robert Martinez could review the language for approval of the replacement marker.
- Member seconded, and the motion was passed unanimously.

Committee Matters

Nominations and Report of Review Committees

**Member Purvis, motion clear nothing to discuss or review move to the next item.
Member Richey seconded and the motion was passed unanimously.**

Subcommittee Matters

Tax Credit Projects--Reginald Richey

The Architectural Sub-Committee got together this morning and looked at the project files and photos, and several applicants answered questions about submittals. After reviewing that material and the Memorandum, I would like to make the following motion:

For Part 1 Amendments:

I move to **approve** the Part 1 Amendment for the following properties with the conditions noted:

The Alexander Craig House, 607 Edith Boulevard, SE, Albuquerque, with the following conditions:

- Parapet heights are to remain unchanged, with appropriate waterproofing and removal of visible metal components.
- Roof to be re-framed with the dimensioned wood joists, not composite ones, due to low clearances.
- No roofing to be visible at top of parapets.
- Stucco shall be cement-based.

- Member Richey moved to approve.

- Member Purvis seconded and motion passed unanimously.

300 Placitas Road, NW Albuquerque, with the following conditions:

- No roofing to be visible at top of parapets.
- Member Richey moved to approve.
- Member Purvis seconded and motion passed unanimously.

For Part 1 Applications:

I move to **approve** the Part 1 applications as submitted for the following:

- **123 High Street, SE Albuquerque**
- **2301 Vista Larga Avenue, NE, Albuquerque**

- Member Richey moved to approve.
- Member Purvis seconded and motion passed unanimously.

For Part 1 Applications:

I move to **approve** the Part 1 applications for the following properties with the conditions noted:

The Blythe House, 1123 Eighth Street, NW Albuquerque, with the condition that:

- A color sample of the roofing be provided to staff prior to construction.
- Member Richey moved to approve.
- Member Purvis seconded and motion passed unanimously.

404 Carlisle Boulevard, NE Albuquerque with the condition that:

- Window schedule and shop drawings of each typical size of existing and proposed windows be provided to staff prior to construction, to verify match.
- New tile will not be an eligible expense.
- Member Richey moved to approve.
- Member Purvis seconded and motion passed unanimously.

408 Eleventh Street, NW, Albuquerque with the condition that:

- Modified bituminous roofing be used for the low-slope, roof and color to be submitted to staff prior to construction, to verify match.
- New tile will not be an eligible expense.
- Member Richey moved to approve.
- Member Purvis seconded and motion passed unanimously.

1418 Roma Avenue, NW, Albuquerque, with the condition that:

- Diamond pattern asphalt-type shingles be used
- Member Richey moved to approve.
- Member Purvis seconded and motion passed unanimously.

318 Wellesley Place, NE, Albuquerque, with the condition that:

- Staff check the color match of the proposed new shingles prior to construction
- Member Richey moved to approve.
- Member Purvis seconded and motion passed unanimously.

I move to table the Part 1 application for **416 Amherst Drive, NE, Albuquerque** pending staff visit.

- Member Richey moved to approve.
- Member Purvis seconded and motion passed unanimously
- I move to table the Part 1 application for **241 Solano Drive, NE, Albuquerque** pending a written submittal describing roofing and parapet/porch work.
- Member Richey moved to approve.
- Member Purvis seconded and motion passed unanimously.

I move to deny the Part 1 application for **405 Amherst Drive, NE, Albuquerque** as it does not conform to program standards #1, 2, 9, and 10 (cited below) because the front section of the house (including the entire façade and porch, and part of the living room and front bedroom) is to be demolished and a new addition is to be built that will extend the house significantly closer to the street. While the new additions are to be compatible with its extant, historic front portion, the house will have a lost a great deal of its historic and physical integrity. We believe the property will no longer contribute to the historic district (see Stature 7-2-18.2(2013), cited below) because it will have lost its historic integrity through the demolition of the front, character-defining portion of the building. There are further impacts to its site and environment.

- Member Richey motion to deny the Part 1 application.
- Member Purvis seconded and motion passed unanimously.
- Member Purvis then moved that the program standards are to be included in the minutes.
- Member Richey seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

From the program standards

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Statute NM 7-2-18-2. (2013): B. The taxpayer may claim the credit if...it maintained those qualities of the property that made it eligible for the inclusion in the official register;

Please note that program Rule 4.10.9. and HPD's Guidelines for Eligible Expenses state that all work on the property, including new construction, will be reviewed for conformance with program standards.

Regulation (Rule) 4.10.9 NMAC:

4.10.9.9: Program Requirements:

...All work that will affect the property during the project time frame shall be described, whether or not it is eligible for credit within the program...

4.10.9.12 Non-Creditable Work Items:

B...The committee shall not approve a project or any part of a project which contains any work item which does not conform to Section 11(4.10.9.11 NMAC)

HPD's Guideline for Eligible Expenses for Credit to State Income Tax (July 20, 2016 and also 2003 version): All work on the property undertaken during the 24-month project approval must be described in the application and must meet program standards.

For Part 2 applications:

I move to approve the Part 2 applications, eligible expenses and tax credits for the following projects:

Property	Eligible Expenses:	50% Tax Credit:
2000 Silver Avenue, SE Albuquerque	\$6,650.00	\$3,325.00
226 Anita Place, Santa Fe,	\$4,038.41	\$2,019.21
13 Berm, NW, Albuquerque	\$28,425.00	\$14,212.50
1507 Cornell Drive, NE, Albuquerque	\$10,883.85	\$5,441.92
1528 Standford Drive, NE, Albuquerque	\$49,127.55	\$24,563.78
Sansome House, 1900 Silver Ave., SE Albuquerque	\$47,148.00	\$23,574.00

- Member Richey moved to approve.
- Member Purvis seconded and motion passed unanimously.

I move to **table the** Part 2 application for the **606 Bryn Mawr Drive, NE Albuquerque** pending remedial work to reduce the adverse visual effects to the historic character of the house due to the application of silver roofing cement on the visible surfaces of the house.

- Member Richey moved to table the application.
- Member Purvis seconded and motion passed unanimously.

This concludes tax credit matters.

Permit Matters

Applicants for Listing in the SHPO Directory under Historic Archaeologist.

i. David Purcell

- Member Boggess moved that David Purcell not be listed.
- Member Dr. Bandy seconded, and motion passed unanimously.

Applicants for Listing in the SHPO Directory under Principal Investigator/Project Director.

1. Lewis Borck

- Member Boggess moved that Lewis Borck be listed.
- Member Dr. Bandy seconded, and motion passed unanimously.

2. Logan Ralph

- Member Boggess moved that Logan Ralph not be listed.
- Member Dr. Bandy seconded, and the motion passed in a 3 to 2 vote by the Committee.

Applicants for Listing in the SHPO Directory under Principal Investigator Directory & Supervisory Archaeological /Crew Chef:

1. Samuel Cason

- Member Boggess motion to table Samuel Cason contingent upon resubmitting his work experience chart to properly reflect his work in New Mexico.
- Member Dr. Bandy seconded and motion passed unanimously.

Applicants for Listing in the SHPO Directory under Supervisory Archaeological/Crew Chief:

1. Sarah Griffith

2. Selby Magee

3. Lisa Sparks

- Member Dr. Bandy recused himself from the motion for Sarah Griffith and Selby Magee.
 - Member Boggess moved that Sarah Griffith and Lisa Sparks be listed.
 - Member Toya seconded, and motion passed unanimously.
-
- Member Boggess moved that Selby Magee be listed contingent on submitting an updated experience chart.

- Member Toya seconded, and motion passed unanimously.

Applicants for a 2019 General Archaeological Investigation Permit and Annual Unmarked Human Burial Excavation Permit:

1. Faculty of Archaeology, Leiden University

- Member Boggess moved that the 2019 General Archaeological Investigation Permit and Annual Unmarked Human Burial Excavation permits not be granted but grant him a Project Specific and Individual Unmarked Burial Excavation Permit contingent on the submission of proper paperwork.
- Member Dr. Bandy seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

Applications for a Project-Specific Permit and Individual Unmarked Burial Excavation Permit for Private Land:

1. University of Massachusetts Amherst-2019 Field Season of the Nuestra Senora de Belen Archaeological Project(NSBAP)

- Member Boggess moved that the University of Massachusetts Amherst be granted a permit contingent on the submission of proper paperwork.
- Member Dr. Bandy seconded, motion passed unanimously.

Applications for a Project-Specific Permit and Individual Unmarked Burial Excavation Permit for State Land:

1. SWCA –Historic Properties Treatment Plan for the Oso Grande 345-kV Gen-Tie Project- Eddy and Chavez Counties, New Mexico.

- Member Dr. Bandy recused himself from the motion
- Member Boggess moved that SWCA Historic Properties Treatment Plan for the Oso Grande 345-kV Gen-Tie Project be granted a permit contingent upon receipt of requested changes.
- Member Purvis seconded and motion passed unanimously.

2. SWCA – Archaeological Testing Plan for the Three Sites along the Southwestern Public Service Company’s Eddy to Kiawa Transmission Line Project.

- Member Dr. Bandy recused himself from the motion.
- Member Boggess moved that SWCA Testing Plan for the Three Sites along the Southwestern Public Service Company’s Eddy to Kiawa Transmission Line Project be granted a permit contingent upon receipt of requested changes.
- Member Purvis seconded and motion passed unanimously.

Applicants for a Project – Specific Permit:

1. Versar-TRU Survey of Four SLO Parcels in Lea County, Southeastern New Mexico for the Project: BPA 10 Additional Investigations at the Merchant Site (LA 43414) and TRU Survey at 51 Sites in the Carlsbad Field Office, New Mexico

- Member Boggess moved that Versar-TRU Survey of Four SLO Parcels be granted a permit.

- Member Dr. Bandy seconded, and motion passed unanimously.

Applicants for and Individual Unmarked Burial Excavation Permit for Private Land:

1. Catrina Banks Whitley: 2019 Summer Field Season at LA 37627, a Pueblo III, Development Period/Pot Creek Phase Site.

- Member Boggess moved that Catrina Banks Whitley be granted a permit.
- Member Dr. Bandy seconded, and motion passed unanimously.

Applicants Listing in the SHPO Directory under Historian:

1. David Purcell

- Member Boggess moved that David Purcell be listed.
- Member Dr. Bandy seconded, and motion passed unanimously.

Discussion Items:

1. Updates in the SHPO Directory Applications:

The Committee discussed the creation of a new format to the applications for listing in the SHPO Directory and the Committee concluded a separate application for each listing was appropriate. The alternative was to provide one application for archaeology and Cultural Anthropology listings and another for the various built environment specialist.

Adjournment 3:26 pm